



CLIMATE CHANGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

April 30, 2009

MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, April 30, 2009, 2:00 PM at the Northwest Neighborhood Center, 2160 N. 6th Ave. Tucson, Arizona.

Primary CCC Members in Attendance

- Jonathan Overpeck, UA Institute for the Study of the Environment
- Andy Laurenzi, Center for Desert Archaeology
- Phil Swaim, Swaim Associates
- Paul Green, Tucson Audubon Society
- James MacAdam, Watershed Management Group
- Pat Patton, UA Eller School of Business
- Jane Poynter, Paragon Space Development Corp
- Joanie Sawyer, PRO Neighborhoods
- Tomas Leon, Community Foundation of Southern Arizona
- Varga Garland, Community Food Bank

Alternate CCC Members in Attendance

- Neil Markowitz, Environmental Education Exchange
- Carl Rosborough, Fred G. Acosta Job Corps Center
- Jan Gordley, Gordley Design Group
- Maioloa Coleman, Grace Temple Missionary Baptist Church
- Terry Galligan, Old Pueblo Community Foundation
- Julie Evans, Native Seeds/SEARCH
- Barbara Warren, Retired M.D.

Staff in Attendance

- David Schaller, Office of Conservation and Sustainable Development (OCSD)
- Nicole Urban-Lopez, OCSD

Public in Attendance

- Tedra Fox, Pima County
- Susanne Cotty, PAG
- Dave Ewoldt, Natural Systems Solutions

AGENDA ITEMS

1. Call to Order/Roll Call

- A quorum was established and the meeting commenced at 2:10 p.m.

2. Welcome and Introductions

- Staff and committee members introduced themselves.
- A copy of the committee roster was distributed.
- Staff will continue to update the committee members' information and will redistribute the roster to the CCC.

3. Objectives of the Committee

- a. Ordinance creating the CCC
 - The concept for the CCC was approved by Mayor and Council as outlined in the Framework for Advancing Sustainability in July 2008.
 - Mayor and Council formally created the CCC in October 2008 and appointed the current members to the committee in February 2009 by a unanimous vote.
 - Committee members are appointed for 2 year terms and can serve for up to 4 terms.
 - Copies of the Framework for Advancing Sustainability and the 2008 Regional Greenhouse Gas Emissions Inventory were distributed to the CCC. Both documents are also available online at www.tucsonaz.gov/ocsd by clicking on the link “View all Reports and Media Releases” on the homepage.
- b. General subject areas CCC will address
 - Page 22 (appendix A) of the Framework outlines the primary functions of the committee.
 - Mayor and Council passed the Mayors’ Climate Protection Agreement (MCPA) in 2006.
 - The goals of the MCPA are to reduce greenhouse gas emissions generated city-wide to 7% below 1990 levels by 2012.
 - The Office of Conservation and Sustainable Development was created to facilitate the City’s fulfillment of the goals of the MCPA.
 - The CCC was created to provide input on the City’s sustainability and climate change planning processes and to assist with the development of a Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation Plan (Climate Change MAP) to achieve the greenhouse gas emissions reductions under the MCPA.
 - Staff completed a Regional Greenhouse Gas Emissions Inventory with PAG in 2008 that establishes baseline emissions data.
- c. Relationship to other committees
 - Strategies that the CCC is considering may be reviewed by other relevant advisory committees.
- d. Role of CCC subcommittees
 - The ordinance creating the CCC allows for the creation of subcommittees.
 - Stakeholders or areas of technical expertise that are not on the committee can be added to subcommittees.
 - At least one primary CCC member must sit on each subcommittee.
 - Subcommittees can be comprised of 3-7 people each.
 - No more than 3 subcommittees can exist at a time.
 - It was suggested that Pima County, other jurisdictions and the utilities have a formal role on the CCC. Staff explained that Ex-officio members can be added to the CCC, but this would have to go to Mayor and Council for approval as an amendment to the ordinance that created the CCC.
 - Staff reminded the CCC that jurisdictional and utility representatives can serve on subcommittees and the committee can request their participation in regular meetings as needed. Staff also clarified that the Climate Change MAP will focus on greenhouse gas reductions for the City of Tucson and will not be inclusive of other jurisdictions, though they are encouraged to collaborate and learn from this process for regional sustainability.
 - It was pointed out that some operations are the responsibility of Pima County, such as public health, so the County should be included in the discussion about greenhouse gas emissions reduction strategies that affect how the public health agency operates.
 - Staff clarified that the CCC can recommend mitigation strategies that involve other agencies, jurisdictions, etc. Adoption of these recommendations by Mayor and Council would task the City with working with the other entities to implement the strategies. However, care must be taken because the City does not have the authority to regulate other jurisdictions so the strategies need to be collaborative in nature.
 - It was commented that a regional planning approach can still be incorporated as the committee moves forward in this process, especially with the inclusion of additional stakeholders in the subcommittees.

- It was suggested that staff invite other jurisdictions, utilities and stakeholders to attend CCC meetings.
 - Staff commented that the goal is to deal with greenhouse gas emissions in Tucson first, but to stay apprised of the other regional planning efforts in the interim.
 - The University of Arizona signed onto the University Presidents' Climate Commitment which they are aggressively trying to achieve. The UA's ultimate goal is to net zero carbon emissions.
 - It was asked whether a conflict of interest exists if committee members have relationships with multiple organizations. Staff reported that is not a conflict of interest and as a stakeholders group it is assumed that committee members are affiliated with multiple community groups.
 - It was suggested that a map of the various community organizations working on sustainability and climate change be prepared.
- e. Role of CCC alternates
- The committee was created with 13 primary members and 13 alternates.
 - If a primary member is absent from a committee meeting, their alternate can be counted toward the quorum.
 - If a primary member is not present, then their alternate can vote in their place.
 - Both primary and alternate members can equally contribute to committee discussion if both are present.

4. Meeting Parameters

- The CCC is subject to Arizona's Open Meeting Law
- Quorum is met with 7 primary members or a combination of 7 primary members and alternates. Alternates only count toward quorum if their primary member is absent.
- Committee members are prohibited from conducting CCC business outside of regularly scheduled and publicly announced meetings in accordance with the Open Meeting Law if a quorum of committee members is present.
- A quorum can be met through email so committee members are urged not to conduct CCC business via email. Avoid using "reply all" to emails that might inadvertently create a quorum.
- The committee can decide the frequency and duration of future meetings.
- Staff will take minutes during the meetings, which will be posted to Boards and Commissions website, CCC section, once they are approved by the committee.
- Committee members and staff can request future agenda items.
 - i. In an effort to limit the scope of agenda items to the goals of the CCC and to respect time constraints of committee members, it was suggested that the committee vote on potential future agenda items before they are scheduled.
 - ii. Staff indicated that the committee can determine what procedures it wants to follow for selecting future agenda items.
 - iii. The committee decided that during the Future Agenda Items agenda item, staff will review the list of suggested future agenda items for the committee to vote on.
- Staff explained the process for staff direction and submittal of a Legal Action Report, which gets posted on the Clerk's Boards and Commissions website. The committee agreed to follow the current process.
- Staff indicated that the committee can determine if voting occurs by consensus or by majority.
 - i. Comments were received that voting by majority is suitable, though the committee would like to try to strive for a consensus.

5. Selection of CCC Co-chairs

- No action taken. This item was tabled until the next committee meeting.
- Only primary committee members can serve as Co-chairs per the ordinance that created the CCC.
- Staff explained that the role of the Co-chairs is to work with staff to plan the meeting agendas and coordinate the work of the CCC. The Co-chairs will also be responsible for running future committee meetings.

- Committee members interested in serving as a Co-chair should email David Schaller prior to the next committee meeting. David will distribute the bios of those interested to the committee.

6. Climate Change and the Southwest presentation by Dr. Jonathan Overpeck

- Slide 3: There is no data for the grey areas on the map shown
 - i. The global average for warming is .8° C but southern Arizona has warmed more.
 - ii. Carbon dioxide has a larger effect on global warming than other greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions and it stays in the atmosphere longer than other GHGs.
- Slide 5: This slide shows the averages of different GHG emissions scenarios run through about 20 different models.
 - i. It is difficult to model the effects of GHG emissions on global warming because scientists can't predict future levels of GHG emissions because of variables such as economic changes, future development, etc.
 - ii. Climate change modeling provides a range of potential scenarios.
 - iii. Some models are predicting warming of 6.4° C over the next 100 years.
- Slide 6: The models show that most warming in the southwestern U.S. will occur in the summer.
- Slide 11: Dry zones are expected to expand northward by 2-3 degrees latitude.
- Slide 19: Climate change is going to make natural droughts much worse.
- Slide 20: Scientists are 100% sure global warming is happening and 90% sure humans are causing it.
- It was asked if there is evidence that there will be a shifting of the Gulf Stream in the Atlantic Ocean. Dr. Overpeck said yes and it is being researched, but this is not an indicator of global cooling.

7. Selection of next meeting date/time and discussion of future meeting schedule

- David will schedule the next CCC meeting for May before Memorial Day
- The future meeting schedule will be determined at next committee meeting

8. Future Agenda Items

- Presentation from Pima County on their sustainability/climate change planning processes
- Presentation from PAG on 2008 Regional Greenhouse Gas Emissions Inventory
- Asset mapping of other stakeholders that should know about the CCC and be involved in their planning process
 - i. Staff will distribute a list of the community groups working on sustainability and climate change in advance of this item.
- Selection of Co-chairs
- Selection of future meeting schedule

9. Call to the Audience

10. Adjournment at 4:23 p.m.